



El-Umdah:

Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Al-Qur'an Tafsir

Vol. 7, No. 1, 2024

DOI:10.20414/El-Umdah.v5i2

<https://journal.uinmataram.ac.id/index.php/el-umda>

HASSAN HANAFI'S QURANIC HERMENEUTICS: ANALYSIS OF THE INTERPRETATION OF THE TERMS *AL-ARD* AND *AL-MĀL*

Taufiqurrahman¹

Abstract: *This article questions the extent to which Hassan Hanafi's phenomenological hermeneutical ideas can be applied in understanding the text of the Quran. The research adopts a literature approach in critically examining the hermeneutics of the Quran by Hassan Hanafi, with a focus on the interpretation application regarding land (al-ard) and property (al-māl). The primary data sources primarily come from several of Hasan Hanafi's works. The research findings indicate that Hassan Hanafi's phenomenological hermeneutics is fundamentally based on the maudhu'i interpretation method. His interpretations do not apply the principle of hermeneutics in the sense of verstehen, where the interpreter is subjective and intervenes in the meaning of the text, but rather erklaren, by objectively explaining the text. This can be seen in the understanding of the terms al-ard and al-māl, where their interpretations are obtained from the sound of the text or a series of scattered texts in the Quran. Regarding the phenomenology he uses as an approach, it is evident that he takes natural and social phenomena as an explanation of the meaning of the text. This is certainly different from Fazlurrahman, Arkoun, Nasr Hamid Abu Zaid, who elaborate and seem to drift in the vortex of Western thought*

Keywords: *Hassan Hanafi, hermeneutics, Qur'anic interpretation, phenomenology, liberator.*

Abstrak: Artikel ini mempertanyakan sejauh mana ide hermeneutika fenomenologis Hassan Hanafi dapat diterapkan dalam memahami teks al-Qur'an. Penelitian mengadopsi pendekatan kepustakaan dalam melakukan telaah kritis terhadap hermeneutika Al-Qur'an Hassan Hanafi, dengan fokus pada aplikasi penafsiran mengenai pertanahan (*al-ard*) dan properti (*al-māl*). Sumber data primer utama berasal dari beberapa karya Hasan Hanafi. Hasil penelitian menemukan bahwa hermeneutika fenomenologis Hassan Hanafi pada dasarnya berpijak pada metode tafsir maudhu'i. Penafsiran yang dilakukannya tidak menerapkan prinsip hermeneutika dalam arti verstehen, di mana penafsir bersifat subjektif yang cenderung mengintervensi makna teks, melainkan bersifat erklaren dengan menjelaskan teks secara objektif. Hal ini terlihat pada pengertian lafadl *al-ard* dan *al-māl* yang penafsirannya diperoleh dari bunyi teks atau rangkaian teks yang tersebar dalam Al-Qur'an. Terkait dengan fenomenologi yang digunakannya sebagai pendekatan terlihat ketika ia mengambil fenomena alam dan sosial sebagai penjabar makna teksnya. Hal ini tentunya berbeda dengan Fazlurrahman, Arkoun, Nasr Hamid Abu Zaid yang mengelaborasi dan seolah hanyut dalam pusaran pemikiran Barat.

Kata Kunci: *Hassan Hanafi, hermeneutika, penafsiran al-Qur'an, fenomenologi, pembebas*

¹The State Islamic Institute of Kediri. Email : rtaufiq@gmail.com

A. Introduction

Hassan Hanafi, as contemporary Islamic figure, has a desire to reinterpret the text of al-Qur'an, with the jargon *ṣāliḥun fī kullī makānin wa zamanin*. For this reason, he tried to adopt the methods and knowledge developed and used by the West to understand the problems of its society, by trying to re-examine what is in their texts. This choice has indeed developed in contemporary Islamic thinkers because of their interaction with Western methods and sciences that are considered capable of solving Western problems, which according to him, are due to a reinterpretation of their scriptural texts. The hermeneutical method he offers is expected to provide breakthroughs to the problems that the community has long felt, where interpretations mostly speak about the text without being correlated with the contextual events affecting the community. This approach ultimately leads to Hanafi being referred to as an interpreter who liberates through emancipatory criticism.²

To improve the interpretation of the Qur'an so that it can be grounded, Hassan Hanafi offers several approaches, namely the approach of *ushul fiqh*, phenomenology, Marxism, and hermeneutics. *Ushul fiqh* is taken from the tradition of Islamic methods, phenomenology is taken from the thought of Husserl, Marxism is taken because of the case of injustice felt in Egypt, and hermeneutics is taken from the thought of Poul Ricoure. Therefore, what is proposed by Hassan Hanafi is interesting to discuss as part of the development of contemporary methodologies for interpreting the Quran. This article further examines a topic rooted in a question, whether Hassan Hanafi can be considered as someone who attempts to interpret the Quran using hermeneutical methods, or whether such methods have ever been practiced to interpret the Quran in search of solutions for the issues of the ummah? And when interpreting the Quran, is it appropriate to label his interpretation as emancipatory and liberating *tafsir*?

Hasan Hanafi's thoughts regarding the methodology of interpreting the Quran have attracted the attention of many people. This is evident from the abundance of writings discussing it. For example, Hermanto Halil examined Hanafi's thematic method as an effort to understand how the text is read by involving the events happening at that time, especially those occurring in Egyptian society under the regime of Anwar Sadat.³ Meanwhile, Ilham B. Saenong concluded in his research that Hanafi's proposed method of interpretation is a practical method that

² Ilham B. Saenong, *Hermeneutika Pembebasan: Metodologi Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi* (Jakarta: Teraju, 2002).

³ Hermanto Halil, "Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an Hassan Hanafi; Memadukan Teks Pada Realitas Sosial Dalam Konteks Kekinian," *Al-Thiqah: Jurnal Ilmu Keislaman* 1, no. 02 (2018): 54–74.

addresses the needs of the Muslim community at that time.⁴ On the other hand, Taufiqurrahman, in his writings, discusses new ideas about the procedures and processes of interpreting the Quran by Hassan Hanafi. However, he is more focused on the ontology of the Quran, the sources of interpretation, the method of interpretation, and the approach to interpretation, with less emphasis on the hermeneutical aspect.⁵

In this study, the author wants to examine other aspects that are different from previous studies, which focus more on the aspects of the truth of the use of hermeneutics and consistency as a method used by Hassan Hanafi, so that he is known as an emancipatory liberationist *mufasssir*. In addition to the desire to compare with applicable interpretations in the history of interpretation that seek answers to the problems of the ummah. and the object of study is the interpretation of the meaning of *al-ard* (land), and *al-māl* (property).

B. Results and Discussion

This research adopts a literature approach in critically examining the hermeneutics of the Quran by Hassan Hanafi, focusing on the interpretation applications regarding land (*al-ard*) and property (*al-māl*). The primary data sources primarily come from several of Hanafi's direct writings, such as *Islam In Modern World: Religion, Ideology, Development, Min al-Naql ila al-'Aql: 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān, al Dīn wa al-Šaurah fi Mišr*, and *Hermeneutics of the Quran*, which has been translated into Indonesian. Additionally, secondary data sources refer to several literature pieces that study Hanafi's thoughts, particularly those related to his hermeneutical ideas. Data collection is conducted through documentary study and descriptive-analytical analysis to provide a comprehensive understanding of Hanafi's approach and contributions in the context of Quran interpretation.

1. Hassan Hanafi and His Thought

Hassan Hanafi's thinking cannot be separated from two things that influenced him, namely first, related to the locus of his intellectual tendency, Eastern heritage, and Western heritage, and secondly related to the socio-political situation in which he lives and interacts. Hassan Hanafi⁶ was born on February 13, 1935, in Cairo, in the al-Azhar neighborhood, near the Saladin fortress. His basic education was completed in 1948, after which he continued his secondary education at the Khalil Agha Madrasa and finished in 1952. In his

⁴ Saenong, *Hermeneutika Pembebasan: Metodologi Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi*.

⁵ Taufiqurrahman, "Epistemology Ta'wil: A Study of Hassan Hanafi's Ideas in Interpreting Al-Qur'an," *QOF: Jurnal Studi al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 7, no. 2 (December 30, 2023): 225–44, <https://doi.org/10.30762/qof.v7i2.1376>.

⁶ He was born from a blend of Egypt and Morocco, because his grandfather was from Morocco while his grandmother was from the bani Mur tribe. selengkapnya baca Riza Zahriyal Falah and Irzum Fariyah, "Pemikiran Teologi Hassan Hanafi," *Fikrah* 3, no. 1 (2015): 203.

spare time, used to join in small discussions on the organization al-Ikhwan al-Muslimun, which was then growing. Participation in these discussions was inspired by the thoughts of Sayyid Quthb, a phenomenal figure at that time.⁷ Higher education was taken at Cairo University by majoring in philosophy and was able to complete in 1956, with a bachelor's degree (BA). After completing his undergraduate education, he continued his studies in France at the University of Sarbone by concentrating on the study of pre-modern to modern Western thought.

His interaction with various scholarly circles is what led Hassan Hanafi to master various disciplines, which later influenced his thinking. His method of thinking and the history of philosophy were influenced by Jean Gitton, who sharpened his dialectical thinking through the process of mastering historical criticism of the scriptures developed by Spinoza. Meanwhile, Paul Ricœur⁸ contributed to teaching consciousness analysis and hermeneutics. With this, he attempted to develop a way of thinking in interpreting the Quran, which he later poured into the agenda of the project he proposed, *al-Turaṣ wa al-Tajdīd*. He wrote in his book about three renewal agendas he proposed for the advancement of Islam: *first*, to reconstruct the Islamic tradition by critically interpreting the classical heritage; *second*, to criticize and reconstruct Western culture; *third*, to build a theory of Quranic interpretation as liberation in all aspects, religious and cultural, by making Islam the ideological foundation of humanity in facing contemporary realities and issues.⁹

In relation to the renewal of Ushul Fiqh, he was greatly influenced by the thinking of Massignon and also influenced his master's thesis, "Les Mothodes d'Exeges: Essei Sur La Science des Fondament de La Conprehension Ilmu Ushul Fiqh" ("Methodology of Interpretation: An Attempt to Reconstruct the Science of Ushul Fiqh"). Meanwhile, the phenomenological approach he used was greatly influenced by Edmund Husserl. This is particularly evident in his dissertation entitled "L'exeges de La Phenomenologie, L'etat actuel de La Methode Phenomenologie et Sonoplication au Phenomene Religiux" ("Phenomenological Interpretation: The Current State of Phenomenological Method and Its Application to Religious Phenomen"a). Edmund Husserl had a

⁷ See Marzuqi Agung Prasetyo, "Model Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi," *Jurnal Penelitian* 7, no. 2 (Agustus 2015): 366, <http://dx.doi.org/10.21043/jupe.v7i2.819> His encounter with Sayyid Quthb changed his thinking to focus more on religious thought and social change.

⁸ Falah and Farihah, "Pemikiran Teologi Hassan Hanafi," 223–24, Husserl also influenced the formation of consciousness analysis.

⁹ The term commonly used is *al-ana*, as the position of the Muslim Ummah to progress, then he must dialogue with three aspects, where all three are challenges as well as sources of progress, namely *al-Turats al-Qadim*, *al-Turats al-Gharb*, and *al-Waqaiq al-Basyariyah*. See the comparison with the writing of Saenong, *Hermeneutika Pembebasan: Metodologi Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi*, 71–75.

significant influence on Hassan Hanafi's phenomenological analysis, which he used to discover the essence of reality, where phenomena are allowed to speak for themselves without being influenced by prejudice. The process of capturing the essence of an object is done using reduction, which eliminates anything that disturbs it, subjective but obtained from other sources, and objective, as well as from knowledge itself.¹⁰

When he returned to Egypt from his intellectual formation process in France, Hassan Hanafi found the condition of Egypt and generally the Arab nation in chaotic conditions and lost the war against Israel. Especially for Egypt, the chaos occurred because of the formation of extremist groups that were getting stronger, and ended with the death of Anwar Saddat in 1981 in a bloody incident at a military parade, which was carried out by military members of al-Ikhwan al-Muslimun sympathizers with indiscriminate shooting, strafing the stage of honor and the emergence of conflict between Islamist groups and the government.

At that time, Hassan Hanafi tried to build the idea of uniting religion with the state, religion with general science and campus with the state. At that time Hassan also did a lot of scientific intellectual activities and was active in scientific service, such as being a guest lecturer in France, Belgium, the United States, Kuwait, Japan and Morocco, being an advisor to the UN university program in Tokyo, and also secretary of the Egyptian philosophical society, and in the forum of writers and solidarity of the Asian-African Movement. *Qadaya Mu'asirat fi Fikrina al-Mu'asir* (1976), is an article written by him with content about the reality of Arab society at that time by revealing an analysis of the task of a thinker in facing its problems, and efforts to renew Islamic thought to revive the traditional cultural richness of Islam.

When Egypt was in a stable condition, Hassan Hanafi moved a lot to express his ideas in many writings, such as *al-Turas wa al-Tajdid*, talking about the basic ideas of renewal and its steps. *Dirasah Islamiyah*, talks about the description and analysis of renewal in classical sciences, such as ushul fiqh, ushuluddin, philosophy, where Hanafi tries to adapt it to contemporary discourse. *Al-Din wa al-Tsaurah 1952-1981*, talks about the struggle that must be carried out to get the Arab nation out of weakness, decline and decline by building the idea of building national culture in the relationship between Islam, the Islamic left movement and national integrity. *Muqaddimah fi ilm al-*

¹⁰ Henry Hermersma, *Tokoh-Tokoh Filsafat Batar Modern* (Jakarta: Gramedia, 1983), 117.

Istighrab, talks about Western civilization by inviting Muslims to respond back to the orientalist attacks on Islam.¹¹

2. Hasan Hanafi's Hermeneutics of Qur'anic Texts

For Hassan Hanafi, hermeneutics is a comprehensive method for interpreting the Qur'an in accordance with the needs of society, where he includes various theories of interpretation of both text and reality.¹² In interpreting the text of the Qur'an with the hermeneutic method, Hassan Hanafi puts five premises to get the expected interpretation. The premises are: 1). Revelation must be placed in a space, *apoche*, without questioning the status of the text. 2). Al-Qur'ān is considered as an ordinary text such as literary works, philosophical texts, historical documents, although sacred, it is only a transfiguration of human language. 3). The interpretations that occur are not judged as wrong or right, but only as differences due to different points of view. 4). Plurality of interpretations is common due to differences in understanding the text. 5). Differences and conflicts in interpretation are not theoretical conflicts, but reflections of socio-political differences, group interests.¹³

According to Hassan Hanafi, understanding the Qur'an cannot be separated from the long history of interpretation in its various versions, because it cannot be separated from the environment in which a tafsir was written. But the most important significance and spirit of the Qur'an can be explored. In this case there are two, namely the spirit of al-Qur'an is divine, and sacred, called *al-mahmūl*, while other interpretations are called *al-hawāmil*, profane which is praxis following social conditions also related to language (Arabic), geographical conditions, social, civilization. *Al-hawāmil* is divided into three: *first*,

¹¹ Hassan Hanafi's thought can be periodized into three periods, namely: First, the period as a scientist who thinks more philosophically, starting when he was a student in France until the defeat of Arabia and especially Egypt from Israel (1956-1970). Second, the dialogical critical period, where he tried to combine two forces that were always in conflict upon his return to Egypt, namely religious groups and the government. He tried to integrate religion and state, campus and state, and religion and science. Third, the period of building a new ideology to get Muslims out of their backwardness, which was recorded in *al-Turats wa al-Tajdid*, See Ahmad Hasan Ridwan, *Reformasi Intelektual Islam: Pemikiran Hassan Hanafi Tentang Reaktualisasi Tradisi Keilmuan Islam* (Ittaqa Press, 1998), 129–31; and compare to the writing of Taufiqurrahman Taufiqurrahman, *Pemikiran Dan Gerakan Pembaruan Islam Modern Dan Kontemporer* (Surabaya: Pustaka Islamika, 2014), 160.

¹² Hassan Hanafi, *Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an* (Yogyakarta: Pesantren Nawasea, 2005), 8–18 Hermeneutics is the science of the process of revelation from letters to reality, from logos to reality, and the transformation of God's mind to human life. In its application, hermeneutics performs deduction as well as induction, where in the interpretation of the text, it performs explanation, understanding and realization. The interpreter receives the meaning while placing it in a rational structure and reality.

¹³ Hassan Hanafi, *Islam In Modern World: Religion, Ideology, Development* (Kairo: Anglo Egyptian, 1995), 417–18.

maudhuiyyah, related to geographical, sociological, and periodization; *al-maudhuiyyah al-zattiyah*, related to the subject or actor when al-Qur'an was revealed, which consists of narration, qira'at and rasm; and *al-zattiyaah*, related to the text which includes lexology, balaghah and tafsir itself.¹⁴

The step of interpretation of al-Quran text, Hassan Hanafi in this case uses the thematic method, to find a rational identity between revelation, rationality and nature through efforts to analyze, synthesize and assemble parts that are identical to the object so as to give birth to a new interpretation in an individual-personal awareness. Because Hassan Hanafi lives in social reality, he uses a social approach when reading texts. In his view, reading the text means understanding and interpreting, as a form of interpretation and takwil, where perception must be avoided. Understanding the text uses the logic of language and text orientation, namely the social context and spirit of the times. The significance of the text, the needs of the times and the spirit of the times are very important to be the object of ta'wil, when the logic of language cannot be used.¹⁵

The thematic method which is the procedure for Hassan Hanafi's interpretation of the Qur'an begins by determining a certain theme while collecting verses that have a connection with that theme. Then proceed with classifying the form of words, whether verbs, nouns. Verbs in this case are related to time, past, present or future singular, plural words; pronouns and subjects. The next step is to build the structure by applying meaning to the subject. The next procedure is to analyze the factual situation experienced by the social community with its various problems, as a social phenomenon. This is followed by a comparison between the ideal and the real. In this case, it is done through deduction of ideal structures from the text and others through induction of factual social situations into the text. And finally, the description of action models, where the interpreter moves from text to action, from theory to practice, where logos and praxis come together to bridge the gap between the ideal and the real.¹⁶

3. The Application of Hassan Hanafi's Hermeneutics Related to Land (al-Arḍ) and Property (al-Māl)

This discussion aims to present the application of Hanafi's Quranic hermeneutics ideas to be easier and clearer to understand. The author takes one of the themes discussed, namely the topic related to land (al-arḍ) and property

¹⁴ See Hassan Hanafi, *Min Al-Naql Ila al-'Aql: 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān* (Kairo: Maktabah Makbul, 2014), 19.

¹⁵ Hassan Hanafi, *Dirasah Falsafiyah* (Kairo: Maktabah Anglo Mishriyah, n.d.), 526–27.

¹⁶ The steps of Hassan Hanafi's interpretive process can be seen in his book *Islam in The Modern World*, in the fourth sub chapter.

(al-māl). In interpreting the issue of al-arḍ (land), Hanafi starts from the problems that occurred in Egypt at that time, where there was perceived injustice among the people due to oppression and abuse of political power by the government under the totalitarian political regime of Anwar Saddam. At that time, there were events that harmed the community due to land confiscation and occupation that they had been living on for cultivation.¹⁷

The root of this issue is what triggers Hassan Hanafi to interpret the text of the Quran according to the issues felt by the Egyptian society, namely land. The term "land" is what is sought as its equivalent from the wording of the Quran, and is found with the term "*al-arḍ*". After examining this term (al-arḍ), 462 related verses were found. Some of the related verses include QS. al-Baqarah:17, QS. Ali Imran: 109, QS. al-Maidah: 120, QS. al-A'raf: 158, QS. al-Taubah: 116, QS. al-Ankabut: 56, QS. al-Zumar: 63, and so on. The term *al-arḍ* found has various forms of expression. The term *al-arḍ* in 454 verses is expressed in the form of a noun. While 8 verses express the term *al-arḍ* in the form of possessive pronouns, which only occur in one place associated with its Creator, Allah. This is as stated in QS. al-'Ankabut: 56, "*O My servants who have believed, indeed, My earth is spacious, so worship only Me*". Such an understanding is a form of linguistic analysis expression to achieve a meaning that the land belongs to Allah.

After analyzing the meaning of lafadz *al-arḍ* in 462 verses, Hanafi concluded that there are five orientations of the meaning of the land, namely: 1). Allah is the only owner of the land and at the same time the heir. The meaning of *al-arḍ* here means the earth and all the land that lies on it, where it is not permissible for someone to claim to be the owner. 2). *Al-arḍ* has the connotation of land inhabited by humans and all His creatures with all the problems faced by humans as inhabitants. This land has many functions, such as peaceful land as a place to live, agricultural land that produces food sources for survival. It can even be a land of conflict, because it is a place of struggle and even war, a land of immigration and exile and a land of experimentation and a land of attraction because of the specifications that the land has in various different spaces. 3). *Al-arḍ* is also defined as the place of action and activity of human beings who are assigned as *khalifatullah* on earth. 4). *Al-arḍ* is defined as Allah's inheritance to humans to be managed, preserved, protected, not defiled or destroyed. 5). *Al-arḍ*

¹⁷ Kazuo Shimogaki, *Kiri Islam (Antara Modernisme Dan Postmodernisme): Telaah Kritis Atas Pemikiran Hassan Hanafi* (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2002), 96.

is also defined as a universal covenant offered to each individual in the form of a moral covenant, not material, unilateral or unilateral.¹⁸

The process of interpretation of the Qur'anic text, the stage of analyzing the structure of meaning is continued by analyzing the factual situation by building a conclusion that the connotation of *al-arḍ* is God's land, which cannot be contested, let alone by oppression. In the meaning of reality, Allah is the only owner of the land and its heirs, where ideally the land means natural land, green land and beauty. From here it can be seen that Hassan Hanafi tries to interpret the text of the Qur'an with the social situation he experiences with a social approach.¹⁹

Regarding the issue of *al-māl* (treasure), Hassan Hanafi tries to understand it by giving an initial explanation that the lafadz connotes more wealth or ownership in general, not meaning money in the literal sense. And in his study of the lafadz found in the Qur'an 86 times in two forms of nouns. A total of 32 times the lafadz is mentioned, in the form of *ghairu mudhaf ila dhamir*, seperti *al-māl*, *malan*, *al-amwal*, *amwalan*. A total of 54 times the lafadz is mentioned in the form of *mudhaf ila dhamir*, which connotes that wealth can be outside private ownership.²⁰

Etymologically, the word *mal* is not a noun, but a relative pronoun. When *mal* is connected to the article (*li*), it means that it belongs to me. The mention of *mal*, also found in the form of *nakirah* 17 times and *ma'rifah* 15 times, means that wealth can be known and can be unknown. The word *mal* itself, when understood in the context of the verse, has three meanings: 1) as a reproach for the person who binds himself to the property, as stated in QS. al-Fajr [89]:20, QS. al-Humazah [104]: 2, QS. al-Balad [90]:6, QS. Maryam [19]:71, QS. al-Taubah [9]:69, QS. al-Kahf [18]:34, QS. Saba [34]: 35. 2). As a prohibition to approach it, as stated in QS. al-An'am [6]:34, QS. al-Nisa' [4]:10, 161, QS. al-Taubah [9]:34, and 3. As an order to give wealth to those who need it, as stated in QS. al-Baqarah [2]:177 and QS. Hud [11]:29. The word *al-māl*, in the negative nominative form, when connected with the adjective ownership, means

¹⁸ Hanafi, *Islam In Modern World: Religion, Ideology, Development*, 506 . This is a form of Hassan Hanafi's commitment as an interpreter who is sensitive to socio-political issues that exist in his environment, restless over the oppression of power over his people.

¹⁹ Compare this with Farid Esack who made South Africa with its apartheid government the focus of his interpretation. His interpretation is based on the lafadz *mustadh'afin*, to explain the position of humans as equal, so that later an egalitarian, just and non-racial society will be built. See Achmad Khudori Soleh, "Mencermati Hermeneutika Humanistik Hasan Hanafi," *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 11, no. 1 (2010): 101,; dan Hasan Basri Marwah, *Farid Esack: Hermeneutika al-Qur'an: Demi Liberalisme Dan Pluralisme* (Jakarta: Lembaga Studi Islam Progresif, 2005), 1.

²⁰ Hassan Hanafi, *Al Dīn Wa Al-Šaurah Fī Miṣr 1952-1981*, n.d., 123.

that the wealth is a collective ownership of those who do not have, including those who are deprived of their rights, the poor and orphans.²¹

In his study of the entire meaning of lafadz *māl* which is expressed in the text of the Qur'an has three content orientations, namely: *First*, Allah is the sole owner of the *mal* and He is the heir and giver of the *māl*. *Second*, humans are only recipients of the *māl* in accordance with His choice, where he is just a trust in humans who only have the right to use with no permissible misuse. *Māl* is not allowed to be hoarded, but ordered to be invested, used for the benefit of goodness, development and defense. *Third*, *Māl* becomes a simple tool for human perfection, because wealth is for human, not otherway around, human for wealth.²²

From the interpretation put forward by Hassan Hanafi related to this wealth, it is also likely due to the conditions of poverty, underdevelopment of Egyptian society at that time which was experienced by the majority of the people, while a small percentage of others controlled property assets, becoming rich people with lots of property. Hassan Hanafi seems to want to awaken the Egyptian people, especially those who have to care about the environment by making such an interpretation, reminding that the property belongs to Allah which is given according to His will, to anyone, and at any time Allah can revoke it again. On the other hand, Hassan Hanafi also provides awareness that wealth will humiliate its owner, and harm, so it is necessary to that part of the wealth (*treasure*), there is a process of share (*tasharuf*) to those who need it. These two examples of Hassan Hanafi's interpretation can represent to be analyzed related to his interpretative approach using phenomenological hermeneutics

4. The Originality and Contribution of Hassan Hanafi's Hermeneutical Ideas

In this section, researchers will examine the ideas and applications of Hassan Hanafi in using hermeneutics to interpret the Al-Qur'an. In this study, researchers will answer the problems raised, namely related to how much commitment Hassan Hanafi has in using hermeneutics in interpreting the Al-Qur'an, including also questioning whether what Hanafi has done, has been done and has something in common with what interpreters did before. It also provides an answer to the problem that Hassan Hanafi is widely regarded as a liberating interpreter, an emancipatory interpreter.

Regarding the application of the hermeneutic approach in interpreting Al-Qur'an related to the issue of land, *al-ard*, for example, as exemplified by the interpretation of Hassan Hanafi, in essence, the same as the form of

²¹ Hanafi, 127–30.

²² Hanafi, 130.

interpretation that has been done by previous interpreters. The difference lies only in the methodology, where the method of previous interpreters in revealing the meaning of the Qur'an is more oriented to the exposure of *juz'iyat, tahlili*, while Hassan Hanafi uses more thematic methods, by collecting verses according to certain themes and then interpreting what is the point of the whole verses. The consequence of the *maudhu'i* method²³ being thematic in interpreting the text of Al-Qur'an has an impact on the breadth, depth of discussion, because it will assemble the entire text of the Qur'anic verse according to the theme to be able to provide a complete understanding, where all perspectives are also used to understand the meaning of the theme.

When viewed from the hermeneutic method itself which is used as an alternative to understanding the text of the Qur'an adopted from the use of Bible hermeneutics, in fact there have been methodological differences in its application. This is due to differences in what definitions and limits are called hermeneutics, not to mention when viewed from the history of the hermeneutic journey itself, until this moment it can be said that it is still in process, not yet fixed and still looking for its identity.

Historically, hermeneutics was first introduced by Plato as *various types of understanding*, then in the hands of Thomas Aquinas it developed into *meaning theories about how texts should be interpreted in order to understand their meaning*, then in Schleiermacher it became a method of understanding texts objectively by understanding the grammatical and psychological authors and in the hands of Dilthey, hermeneutics is a method of understanding texts subjectively where the interpreter participates in it. And even in the hands of Heidegger, hermeneutics developed radically by saying that it is a *mode of being* characterized by *dasein* ontologianism, humans are the center, who have the freedom to interpret according to human nature. By definition, there are simply two, namely *erklaren* and *verstehen*.²⁴ *Erklaren* means explaining objectively what the text says, without intervention, while *verstehen*, on the other hand, explains the text based on the subjectivity of the interpreter, in which he or she participates.

When examined from this angle by paying attention to Hassan Hanafi's interpretation of the issue of *al-arḍ* with the explanation that it belongs to Allah,

²³ Hassan Hanafi criticism of the tahlili method, because it is explained partially, rambling, mixed up with one another, repetition occurs, does not have a rational theme structure, loses a coherent ideology, a global worldview and is uprooted from the needs of the soul and the needs of contemporary society, so he raises the idea of the need for thematic interpretation. Hanafi, *Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an*, 7–8.

²⁴ *Erklaren* is more widely and closely used to understand something according to its objectivity and that is in the natural sciences, while *verstehen* is more used to study human sciences, and is usually accompanied by the subjectivity of the interpreter.

which humans inhabit to be able to live, as managers and *khalifah fi al-ard*, who must protect and maintain it, for mutual prosperity, is a form of ordinary interpretation and means more *erklaren*, not a form of hermeneutics. Hassan Hanafi's interpretation is *thus* like many of the previous scholars of interpretation by referring to the behavior of the prophet and companions in carrying out the function of being the leader of the Muslim ummah in the past. In fact, if we refer to the words of the prophet related to land, there are words of the prophet Muhammad not to abandon the land, and if the land is not used, not planted within a certain period, other people can have it and utilize it. Of course, the behavior of grabbing land that does not belong to someone or the state is also not allowed. Social justice and democracy in the reign of *Khulafa' al-Rashidun*, means understanding the Qur'anic text about land as interpreted by Hassan Hanafi. In the perspective of *mafmun mukhalafahnya*, it means that when the government has practiced not like the *salaf* generation did, it must be criticized. Hassan Hanafi in this case only repeats the understanding of the practice of the early generations in the history of government, which is practical, which can be a frame of understanding of the status of the land. However, because humans are creatures who naturally forget and are wrong because of their orientation towards power, the practice of land grabbing arises, so Hassan tries to provide interpretations as described above.

Researchers did not find anything in Hasan Hanafi's interpretation of the Qur'anic text using hermeneutics in *verstehen* understanding, where the text is understood subjectively by the interpreter and participates in it.²⁵ Clear evidence is obtained in the interpretation of *al-ard*, all explanations are explanations through the content of the text itself, or through the explanation of a series of other verses. This means that Hassan Hanafi only provides conclusions from certain themes, from all of his verses. The shortcomings of Hassan's application in interpreting Al-Qur'an which researchers found were only found in three objects, *al-ard*, *al-māl*, and *al-insan*, this is what makes his ideas imperfect and can be considered unfinished.

From the study above, researchers concluded that Hassan Hanafi is not included in the category of contemporary-liberal interpreters. Hassan Hanafi's thinking as described above is what led to criticism of him from liberal groups, such as Nasr Hamid Abu Zaid and Ali al-Harb. Hassan Hanafi is considered by Abu Zaid to ignore religious texts as autonomous entities, internal relationship systems and their own discourse contexts. Ali al-Harb criticized Hanafi as

²⁵ In the view of researchers, Hassan Hanafi still makes the tradition of classical to modern interpretation such as Sayyid Qutb, *Tafsir Fi Dllal al-Qur'an*, his reference, by emphasizing Arabic language, and because the problem is related to the condition of the oppressed ummah, the orientation is on alleviation and defense of them.

tendentious because of the motives inherent in his theoretical thinking, suffering from mental intellectual narcissism.²⁶

When viewed from the phenomenological hermeneutic approach, if it is understood by an interpretation of the text by interacting it with phenomena,²⁷ according to researchers, what Hassan Hanafi did, something natural and must be done so that there is a relationship with facts that always occur throughout time, both natural and social phenomena. The phenomenon continues to develop, where a text in order to maintain its truth, then the phenomenon can be an explanation. And that is the nature of the Qur'an which is maintained its authenticity, always in accordance with the developments and changes that exist in life, because it comes from the true God, a guide to life and a mercy for the entire universe. And this can be proven from Hassan Hanafi's interpretation of the issue of *al-māl* as an example. Hassan Hanafi interprets *al-māl*, wealth.

Hassan's weakness in trying to build interpretive ideas by offering a phenomenological hermeneutic approach is the absence of applicable supporters who are poured in interpreting many themes, so that it can be known that he is able to prove this approach as a new idea in interpreting the Al-Qur'an. Examples in his interpretation are limited, and to the researcher's knowledge, there are only three objects, namely *al-arḍ*, *al-māl*, and *al-insan*. According to researchers, these three objects.

Related to the nickname received by Hassan Hanafi as an emancipatory interpreter, humanist, liberator and other nicknames, something that is not wrong, because his concentration is on the problematic life of the marginalized Egyptian people, not getting a sense of justice, where he is able to provide a breakthrough idea. But the defense of oppressed groups experienced by the Egyptian people because of the actions of the ruler, because of the case of land grabbing, by building an understanding of the text of Al-Qur'an, is an incidental case right when Hassan Hanafi was in Egypt in the conditions of the political behavior of the ruler like that. But in essence, giving the nickname is not

²⁶ Saenong, *Hermeneutika Pembebasan: Metodologi Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi*, 12–13.

²⁷ According to researchers, there is a difference between phenomenological hermeneutics and phenomenological interpretation. Phenomenological hermeneutics gives more space to the interpreter to interpret based on his subjectivity, and is *verstehen*, while phenomenological interpretation is objective and *erklären*. Still according to researchers, social phenomena, such as for example the equality of men and women in social life, when approached with phenomenological hermeneutics, will give rise to a different interpretation from the sound of the text, where the text of the Qur'an states that men get two parts compared to women only one part. The interpretation can be one compared to one between men and women, because of the emergence of a community phenomenon where men and women have the same position. Only Hassan Hanafi did not touch on this, so it was not found that he used phenomenological hermeneutics, but phenomenological interpretation. This, according to him, is also due to the fact that the Qur'an is valid and authentic, descending from God through angels received by Muhammad who is passive, being a recorder, so that revelation is *verbatim*.

appropriate, this is because he only relies on interpreting the text of the Al-Qur'an in the land issue. Maybe it is only considered better (afdhal) and appropriate, if it is able to provide interpretation of the text of the Qur'an related to many problems that exist in society.²⁸

C. Conclusion

From the above explanation related to the position and application of Hassan Hanafi in interpreting the text of Al-Qur'an, it can be concluded that, first, Hassan Hanafi's idea of interpreting Al-Qur'an with a phenomenological hermeneutic method is built in the maudhu'i methodology building, from which he will apply it to understand the Qur'anic text. Second, in the interpretation through the phenomenological hermeneutic approach, it turns out that what happens in practice is more prominent interpretation such as the interpretation used by previous interpretation scholars, where the hermeneutic is thicker *erklaren* than *verstehen*, which is objective. Third, related to phenomenology as an approach to understanding the text is still in the *erklaren* frame, where natural and social phenomena become explanatory to the understanding of the text, such as the interpretation of *al-arḍ*, which is taken from the context of the text, which is understood as Allah's property, inhabited by humans to live and seek life, as managers as well as caliphs, to be taken advantage of not to be destroyed. Fourth, the nickname pinned on Hassan Hanafi as an emancipatory interpreter, humanist and liberator, is valid, but not on point, because there are not many interpretations he did and it was limited to three objects, *al-arḍ*, *al-māl*, and *al-insan*

Bibliography

Falah, Riza Zahriyal, and Irzum Fariyah. "Pemikiran Teologi Hassan Hanafi." *Fikrah* 3, no. 1 (2015): 201–20.

Halil, Hermanto. "Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an Hassan Hanafi; Memadukan Teks Pada *Realitas Sosial Dalam Konteks Kekinian*." *Al-Thiqah: Jurnal Ilmu Keislaman* 1, no. 02 (2018): 54–74.

Hanafi, Hassan. *Al Dīn Wa Al-Šaurah Fī Miṣr 1952-1981*, n.d.

———*Dirasah Falsafiyah*. Kairo: Maktabah Anglo Mishriyah, n.d.

²⁸ For mere comparison, Sayyid Qutb who was able to produce the interpretation of the Qur'an that was recorded in *Tafsir Fi Dīlāl al-Qur'an*, in essence had similarities as a liberating interpretation, because his views were related to the behavior of political power that was not in favor of the ummah, which at that time al-Ikhwan al-Muslimun who had followers became enemies of the government.

- Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an*. Yogyakarta: Pesantren Nawasea, 2005.
- Islam In Modern World: Religion, Ideology, Development*. Kairo: Anglo Egyptian, 1995.
- Min Al-Naql Ila al-'Aql: 'Ulūm al-Qur'Ān*. Kairo: Maktabah Makbulu, 2014.
- Hermersma, Henry. *Tokoh-Tokoh Filsafat Batar Modern*. Jakarta: Gramedia, 1983.
- Marwah, Hasan Basri. *Farid Esack: Hermenutika al-Qur'an: Demi Liberalisme dan Pluralisme*. Jakarta: Lembaga Studi Islam Progresif, 2005.
- Prasetyo, Marzuqi Agung. "Model Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi." *Jurnal Penelitian* 7, no. 2 (Agustus 2015): 17–24. <http://dx.doi.org/10.21043/jupe.v7i2.819>.
- Ridwan, Ahmad Hasan. *Reformasi Intelektual Islam: Pemikiran Hassan Hanafi Tentang Reaktualisasi Tradisi Keilmuan Islam*. Ittaqa Press, 1998.
- Saenong, Ilham B. *Hermeneutika Pembebasan: Metodologi Penafsiran Hassan Hanafi*. Jakarta: Teraju, 2002.
- Shimogaki, Kazuo. *Kiri Islam (Antara Modernisme Dan Postmodernisme): Telaah Kritis Atas Pemikiran Hassan Hanafi*. Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2002.
- Soleh, Achmad Khudori. "Mencermati Hermeneutika Humanistik Hasan Hanafi." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Qur'an Dan Hadis* 11, no. 1 (2010): 41–60.
- Taufiqurrahman. "Epistemology Ta'wil: A Study of Hassan Hanafi's Ideas in Interpreting Al-Qur'an." *QOF: Jurnal Studi al-Qur'an Dan Tafsir* 7, no. 2 (December 30, 2023): 225–44. <https://doi.org/10.30762/qof.v7i2.1376>.
- Taufiqurrahman, Taufiqurrahman. *Pemikiran Dan Gerakan Pembaruan Islam Modern Dan Kontemporer*. Surabaya: Pustaka Islamika, 2014.