THE DISCOURSE OF PLURALISM IN ISLAM AND HINDUISM
(A CRITICAL EXAMINATION OF THE QUR'AN AND VEDAS)

Lalu Fathoni Hidayat
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta
Email: lalufatoni8@gmail.com

Abstract: The concept of pluralism has been present in Indonesia for a long time, but it is still rejected by many. This rejection is due to the fatwa issued by the Indonesian Ulema Council (Majelis Ulama Indonesia: MUI) that prohibits pluralism. Well-known Da'i constantly repeat and propagate this fatwa. However, from a different perspective, diversity is a necessity and unique to Indonesia. This study is a literature review. The research focuses on direct reading of the scriptures and related literature, as well as analysis of other relevant documents. Descriptive-analytical methods are used to explain the concept of pluralism in Islam and Hinduism. Religious pluralism in Islamic studies is based on the commitment and loyalty of each religious believer to their respective religious teachings, without sacrificing the truth of their own religion for the sake of coexistence and tolerance. Similarly, Hinduism acknowledges that pluralism is an undeniable fact in socio-religious life, recognizing the plurality of humans and other living things. Therefore, in sociological studies, individuals are often used to refer to humans due to their unique characteristics that are not shared by others.

Keywords: Plurality, Scripture, Qur'an and Vedas
INTRODUCTION

As a pluralistic nation, Indonesia has an obligation to maintain and preserve the diversity of religions, tribes, customs, and traditions bestowed by God. Unfortunately, this diversity can be exploited by certain individuals or groups for negative purposes. Religion, which should serve as a solution to social issues, can instead become a trigger for conflict and division. The discourse surrounding religious pluralism remains a widely debated topic among academics, religious leaders, and the general public. Many scholars and religious figures advocate for religious moderation as a means of promoting mutual respect among believers. They educate the public that religious texts which permit killing in the name of religion are teachings motivated by the interests and objectives of certain individuals or groups. Another issue that frequently arises is the making of truth claims that can ultimately lead to divisions. These truth claims are often the result of incorrect translations and interpretations of scriptural texts. Open interpretations of scripture are often monopolized by certain groups to legitimize and justify their teachings.

Pluralism is a contentious issue, particularly in Indonesia where the majority of the population is Muslim. The Indonesian Ulema Council (Majelis Ulama Indonesia: MUI), an institution capable of issuing religious fatwas, argues that pluralism is not in accordance with sharia law. In response to the fatwa, several Muslim scholars have conducted critical studies of scriptural texts, such as those conducted by Jalaluddin Rakhmat, Abd. Moqsith Ghazali, Anis Malik Thoha. In addition to studying scriptural texts, scholars such as Johan Setiawan have conducted studies on Nurcholis Madjid’s ideas about religious pluralism in the context of Indonesia. Non-Muslim scholars also study the discourse of religious pluralism from the perspective of their religion. For example, I Made Dwi Susila Adnyana studies pluralism in Hinduism. No comparative study has been conducted on the discourse of inter-religious pluralism, despite the existence of literature on the subject. Previous research has focused solely on individual religions. This study aims to explore the concept of pluralism in the Qur’an and the Vedas, the holy books of Islam and Hinduism respectively.

This article aims to provide a concrete understanding of the concept of Pluralism in Islam and Hinduism as presented in their respective scriptures. First, how does the Qur'an view religious plurality? Second, how does the Vedas view religious plurality? The paper will address two questions: The focus of this discourse will be on answering these two questions. This article aims to provide solutions to prevent religious fanaticism and promote a sense of holiness among adherents while respecting other religious beliefs. It emphasizes the necessity of pluralism in Islam and Hinduism as a divine mandate. Differences in spiritual practices and worship are merely different paths to reach God.

METHOD

This study was designed using a qualitative approach with a library research methodology. All data was collected through documentation, as it allows for the examination of past work and verification of data validity, interpretation, and conclusions. The data analysis is descriptive-analytical. It combines various opinions of Islamic and Hindu thinkers and other religious figures to explain the concept of Plurality in Islam and Hinduism. The explanations presented are relevant and universally acceptable. Regarding the validity of the data, the author employs source triangulation to test its credibility by verifying the truth of the data obtained from multiple sources. The author chose this method because the research in this writing is a type of library research.7

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Pluralism as a Religious Imperative

One earth was created by God, but it is inhabited by people of different ethnicity, races, languages, customs, cultures, and beliefs. Therefore, diversity is a necessity that cannot be avoided by humans.8 Pluralism is an understanding that encourages peaceful coexistence among diverse humans. However, pluralism in society has two definitions, depending on the person defining it, whether they are liberal or conservative. For liberals, pluralism is a theological concept that seeks to promote mutual respect between religious communities. However, this definition can be problematic as it seeks to equalize religions and prohibits religious adherents from claiming the truth of their own religion. According to this perspective, all religions are considered to be true.9

The concept of pluralism can cause disagreements among religious individuals in Indonesia. Some religious individuals reject pluralism, viewing it as a new religion seeking to

---

unite all existing religions.\textsuperscript{10} This misunderstanding has led to pluralism, originally intended to bridge and harmonize relations between religions, being perceived as a problematic and wild idea. Religious individuals perceive pluralism as a threat to the existence of religious teachings. Pluralism aims to acknowledge and respect the diversity of religious teachings.

In contrast, Abdurrahman Wahid argues that pluralism can promote open-mindedness in the pursuit of truth. He views religious pluralism as a universal\textsuperscript{11} concept and therefore prioritises the preservation of human life by emphasizing social values. In carrying out this task, there should be no religious barriers. It is important to believe that truth belongs to God and therefore humans should not limit themselves to only doing positive things for religions that are different from their own.

In the study of pluralism, the term “One God Many Religions” is often used. This term refers to the idea that one God can be reached through various ways and media. Many religions acknowledge this pluralism, stating that God wills His creatures to seek Him in different ways. Differences exist not only in physical realities, but also in ideas, notions, and religions.\textsuperscript{12} As stated in some sources, “the differences among religions are not a matter of truth and falsehood, but of emphasis and viewpoint:

\begin{center}
\textsuperscript{13}وَلَوۡ شَآءَ رَبُّكَ لَجَعَلَ ٱلنَّاسَ أُمَّةٗ وََٰحِدَةٗٗۖ وَلََ يَزَالُونَ مُخۡتَلِفِينَ
\end{center}

“If your Lord had willed, He would have made mankind one people, but they are always at variance.”

\begin{center}
\textsuperscript{14}وَلَوۡ شَآءَ ٱللََُّّ لَجَعَلَكُمۡ أُمَّةٗ وََٰحِدَةٗ وَلََٰكِن ل ِيَبۡلُوَكُمۡ فِي مَآ ءَاتَىَٰكُمۡ
\end{center}

“If Allah had willed, He would have made you one people (alone), but Allah wants to test you for what He has given you.”\textsuperscript{14}

The verse (Quran 5:48) further supports this idea. Furthermore, in another well-known verse, it is stated that “There is no compulsion in religion.”\textsuperscript{15} The verse not only prohibits forcing someone to adopt a religion but also acknowledges that individuals are free to choose their own beliefs, including the choice to not follow any religion. While individuals have the freedom to choose, they must also accept the risks and consequences of their choices.\textsuperscript{16} This is because God has clearly outlined the paths of right and wrong.

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{10}Ibid, hlm. 57.
\textsuperscript{12}Abd. Moqsith Ghazali, \textit{Argumen Pluralisme Agama Membangun Toleransi Berbasis Al-Qur'an}, Depok: Pesona Depok Estate Al-4, cet. 1, 2009, hlm. xvi
\textsuperscript{13}Q.S. Hud 11: 118.
\textsuperscript{14}Q.S. al-Maidah 5: 48.
\textsuperscript{15}Q.S. al-Baqarah 2: 256.
\textsuperscript{16}Abd. Moqsith Ghazali, \textit{Argumen Pluralisme Agama Membangun Toleransi Berbasis Al-Qur'an}, Depok: Pesona Depok Estate Al-4, cet. 1, 2009, hlm. xvi
\end{flushright}
During the prophetic period of Muhammad, when he migrated to Medina, he made an agreement known as the Medina Charter (Miytsaq al-Madinat). The charter granted the right to freedom of religion to all people of Medina and ensured the protection of safety for Muslims, Jews, Christians, and polytheists. From the beginning of prophet hood, a plural society has been formed and has become the awareness of the people. Islam came after other religions such as Judaism, Christianity, Magi, Zoroaster, Hinduism, Buddhism, Ancient Greece, and Ancient Egypt. Islam does not deny the existence of these religions and their teachings.

Komang Heriyanti states in her journal on the Internalization of the Concept of Pluralism in the Middle of Social Conflict (Hindu Religious Perspective) that pluralism has been encouraged in Hinduism for a long time. This is evident in every Dharma Wacana activity, which conveys the truth of the Vedas and is one of the means to convey the swadarma in the Vedas. Hinduism promotes the discourse of plurality by choosing a moderate religion to avoid social conflicts. It is built on the basis of Shanata Dharma and places pluralism as a necessity, positioning it at the second level of truth after the truth of God. Sri Satya Sai Baba explains the prohibition of criticizing and ridiculing other people's religions and beliefs. According to Hinduism, the worst act is claiming that one's religion is the most correct and denying the religion and beliefs of others. In social life, plurality is inevitable. The Vedas contain the following slokas:

Janāṁ bibhratā babudhā vivacasāmi nānādharmāṇāṁ prthivī yathākāsam, sabhasrāmi dhārā
draviṇasya me duhāṁ dhruveva dhenu ranapashāranti (Atharvaveda XII.1.45)

“May this earth sustain the life of mankind speaking different languages, practicing
different customs (dharman), living in different regions, may this earth bestow a
thousand streams of prosperity, like the endless outpouring of milk (dhruva) produced
by cows” (Sāyaṇācārya, 2005)

Ye yatbhā māṁ prapadyante
tāṁś tathaiva bhajāmy abam
mama vartmānuvartante
manuṣyaṁ pārtha sarvasaḥ (Bhagawad Gita IV.11).

---

17 Ibid, hlm. 5
20 Ibid, hlm. 194.
“However man approaches Me, I accept, O Arjuna. Man follows My path in all” ways (Pudja, 1999).  

Later in the Tutur Jatiswara it is mentioned:

Sakañcan ané idup di jagaté makejang pada ngelab adan, upama mañusa kaadanin I Tampul, I Tembok, I Sëndi wiadin lenan. Buron kaadanin sampi, jaran, kebo miwah ané lenan.

“Everything that lives in the world has a name, such as humans are named I Tampul, I Tembok, I Tendi, and so on. Animals are named cow, horse, buffalo and so on.”

The Sloka and Tutur Jatiswara content demonstrates how Hinduism acknowledges, accepts, and values diversity as an inherent aspect of life. Every individual, group identity, and religious identity is entitled to respect and fair treatment. In Hinduism, individuals are given the freedom to determine their own path to reach God, and differences in rituals are merely a means to an end. For instance, the act of worship in Hinduism is often expressed by visiting a temple to offer prayers.

**Pluralism in Islam**

Islam, as the world’s largest religion, considers religious plurality as a sign of maturity. However, in reality, this attitude is often distorted by some individuals. It is important to revisit the original definition of religion. While experts have varying definitions, etymologically, religion is a Sanskrit term that refers to the beliefs of Hinduism and Buddhism in India. The word “religion” is derived from “a” meaning “not” and “gama” meaning “chaos.”

Religion is a system of rules intended to provide guidance for individuals to navigate the complexities of life, leading to a more peaceful, prosperous, organized, and orderly existence.

Some argue that the word “religion” is derived from “a” meaning “not” and “gam” meaning “to go” or “to walk,” suggesting that religion is eternal and passed down from generation to generation without change. This interpretation of religion is not incorrect because religion embodies universal values that are eternal and will exist throughout time. The last letter 'a' in religion signifies eternity or permanence.

In Islam, the term religion is often referred to as *ad-Din*, which has similar connotations of meaning from the Sanskrit language. It encompasses belief in God or a superhuman power to be worshiped as the creator and ruler of the universe, as well as a particular system of belief and worship. The term “*din*” is derived from the three letters *d-y-n*, which can be interpreted as “*daim*,” meaning debt, or “*din*,” meaning control. Both interpretations imply a

---

22 Ibid, hlm. 199.
23 Ibid,
25 Ibid, hlm. 42.
26 Ibid,
relationship between two parties, with the first party being superior, powerful, feared and respected by the second party.27

The term “religious pluralism” is not commonly used in Islamic scholarly tradition, as it is of Western origin. However, it has gained popularity in the last two decades of the 20th century following an important development in Western wisdom known as Muhammad Imarah. The Arabic term for religious pluralism is “al-ta’addudiyah aldiniiyyah.” According to Malik Thoha, the West’s efforts to promote its modern ideologies, such as democracy, human rights, free markets, and pluralism, are described as “marhalat al-ihtiyat” or the “phase of destruction.”28 In Europe, pluralism emerged during the Enlightenment of the 18th century. This period marked the emergence of new thinking oriented towards rationalism and the liberation of reason from the confinement of the church. This gave rise to a new understanding known as liberalism, whose main content is freedom, tolerance, equality, and diversity (pluralism).

It is widely recognized that liberalism originated as a socio-political ideology. Consequently, the discourse of pluralism, including religious pluralism, which emerged later, was also primarily political. It was a response to the social conditions of Christian society in Europe, which was characterized by intolerance and tension due to the diversity of sects, groups, and religious schools. During the 20th century, the discourse of religious pluralism gained ground among Eastern intellectuals, including the Muslim world. This was promoted by the Christian church and was facilitated by the opening of opportunities for young people to receive education in Western universities. The emergence of new national states after World War II also contributed to this trend. Due to its Western origin and Christian influence, some Muslim scholars may have reservations about the concept of religious pluralism, viewing it as a political tool to prevent the emergence of competing powers.29

Although originating from the West, the concept of religious pluralism has deep roots in Islamic teachings. The Qur'an, as the primary source of Islamic teachings, not only acknowledges but also encourages religious pluralism as a means of promoting cooperation among religious communities to achieve common goals. This approach helps to prevent disputes and conflicts from arising.30 The concept of religious diversity in Islam is mentioned in Surat al-Hajj: 67-69:

\[
	ext{لَكُلُّ أٓمَةٖ جَعَلۡنَا مَنۡسَكًا هُمۡ نَاسِكُوهُٗ فَلََ يَُنََٰزِعُنَّكَ فِي ٱلَۡۡمۡرِِۚ وَٱدۡعُ إِلَىَٰ رَب ِكَٗ إِنَّكَ لَىَٰ هُدٗى مُّسۡتَقِيمٖ وَإِن جََٰدَالُوكَ فَقُلِ \]
\[
\text{ٱللََُّّ أَعۡلَمُ بِمَا تَعۡمَلُونَ ٱللََُّّ يَحۡكُمُ بَيۡنَكُمۡ يَوۡمَ ٱلۡقِيََٰمَةِ فِيمَا كُنتُمۡ فِيهِ تَخۡتَلِفُونَ}
\]

27 Ibid, hlm. 43.
“For each community, Allah has ordained a set of laws and regulations that they must follow. Therefore, they should not argue with you about it, but instead invite them to follow the path of your Lord. If they still argue with you, simply say, “Allah knows best what you do.” On the Day of Judgment, Allah will judge between you regarding the matters you used to dispute.\textsuperscript{31}

Religious pluralism is recognized as a necessity in Islamic teachings as it is believed to be God's will. The creation of human life in this condition is not without reason. If God had wanted, He could have easily created human beings all the same - in one colour, one group, and one religious sect. However, this is not what God intended. In other places, the Qur'an emphasizes that differences and diversity of opinion in religion are part of God's will and purpose in creating. As stated in Surah Hud: 118-119:

\begin{verse}
ولَوۡ شَآءَ رَبُّكَ لَجَعَلَ ٱلنَّاسَ أُمَّةٗ وََٰحِدَةٗٗۖ وَلََ يَزَالُونَ مُخۡتَلِفِينَ إِلََّ مَن رَّحِمَ رَبُّكَِۚ وِلِذَ لِكَ خَلَقَهُمۡۡۗ وَتَمَّتۡ كَلِمَةُ رَب ِكَلَۡمَۡمۡلَََنَّ جَهَنَّمَ مِنَ ٱلۡجِنَّةِ وَٱلنَّاسِ أَجۡمَعِينَ
\end{verse}

“And if your Lord had willed, He would have made mankind one people, but they have always disputed. Those whom your Lord has mercy upon are an exception. Allah has created them for a specific purpose.”\textsuperscript{32}

Therefore, rejecting differences can be seen as opposing His will. This implies that there is no need to reject or eliminate what God has determined based on His authority. Accepting differences can be challenging, particularly for those who are accustomed to a specific type of teaching. Regarding this matter, the Prophet was once reminded that even if he presented the most convincing evidence to certain individuals, they would not follow him, nor would he follow them.\textsuperscript{33} As stated in al-Baqarah: 145:

\begin{verse}
And even if you (Muhammad) give all the verses (information) to those to whom the Book is given, they will not follow your qiblah, nor will you follow theirs. Some of them will not follow the Qiblah of others …”\textsuperscript{34}
\end{verse}

Once again, it is a fact that God desires humans to embrace diversity, including in terms of religion. The key is how humans collectively manage these differences to ensure they are valuable and bring grace to life.

Pluralism in Hinduism

Nasution (1995) recognizes the Hindu religion for its tolerance and appreciation of pluralism. According to experts on the history of religion, there is no evidence of religious intolerance in Hinduism. Religious conflicts are rare and religious exchanges occur peacefully.

\textsuperscript{32} Q.S. Hud 11: 118-119.
\textsuperscript{33} Mahrus As'ad, \textit{Pluralisme Agama Dalam Pandangan Islam}, STAIN Jurai Siwo Metro, hlm. 102
\textsuperscript{34} \textit{Ibid}, hlm. 102.
Hinduism is a philosophical religion that can appreciate the truth in other religions, making it tolerant. Some argue that Hinduism is so tolerant that it can even accept magical religions.\textsuperscript{35}

It does not kill off one culture to be replaced by the single culture from which the religion originated. Unlike cultural imperialism, which imposes a particular culture on all human beings, everywhere, Hinduism nurtures local culture. Unlike cultural imperialism, which imposes a particular culture on all human beings, everywhere, Hinduism nurtures local culture. Unlike cultural imperialism, which imposes a particular culture on all human beings, everywhere, Hinduism nurtures local culture. This approach ensures that human beings are not uprooted from their cultural roots, which can lead to alienation in their own ancestral lands. Hinduism advocates for actions that are oriented towards the common good, rather than individual or group identity.\textsuperscript{36} According to the Bhagavadgita, there are two categories of people: the clever and the foolish, based on their actions. The fool is always bound to act in their own self-interest, while the clever person's actions are characterized by their contribution to the common good, as well as the welfare and order of the world (lokasangraham).\textsuperscript{37}

Hinduism is known for its flexibility and tolerance towards other religions. Siwananda (2003) states that Hinduism is a religion that is both firm on its fundamentals and flexible in readjusting to external things that are not fundamentals. The foundation of Hinduism is based on spiritual truth, and the entire structure of Hindu life is built on eternal truths discovered by Hindu rishis.\textsuperscript{38}

Historically, Hinduism has demonstrated an attitude towards realizing harmony in its interactions with other religions. This assertiveness is not only theoretical but also evident in practice. Hinduism advocates for religious tolerance, as expressed by Swami Vivekananda at the World Parliament of Religions in Chicago in September 1893. Tolerance is crucial in the context of religious diversity as it enables respect and appreciation. In this context, tolerance means respecting and appreciating other religious beliefs while refraining from denigrating or defaming them.\textsuperscript{39}

To achieve tolerance, concrete efforts and attitudes are necessary, including: 1) \textit{Widya}, which in the context of plurality and religious harmony is interpreted as knowledge, understanding, awareness and appreciation in seeing diversity as a reality and part of life; 2) \textit{Maitri}, which is interpreted as sincere love for other beings (people). In this context, Maitri

\textsuperscript{36} \textit{Ibid}, hlm. 200
\textsuperscript{38} \textit{Ibid}, hlm. 201.
\textsuperscript{39} \textit{Ibid},
means an attitude of respect and appreciation for the beliefs and faith choices of others; 3) *Ahimsa*, meaning the disappearance of the desire to harm or kill other beings (people). In the context of religious harmony, *Ahimsa* refers to the absence of the desire to harm, insult, or defame other faiths or religions. Additionally, *Santi*, which means peace, is also crucial. These principles are essential for achieving pluralism in diversity in Indonesia.  

**CONCLUSION**

Based on the above description, it is evident that religious pluralism is a fundamental principle in Islam. It is not merely a theory or concept, but has also been manifested in real-life practices when Islam is embodied in the form of a state. Religious pluralism in Islam acknowledges the diversity of religions, but it does not imply that it accepts the existence of the same truth among religions. Therefore, the unity of religions as a path to God's truth is not recognized. Religious pluralism in Islam is based on the commitment and loyalty of each believer to their respective teachings, without sacrificing the truth of their own religion. This is achieved through recognition of coexistence, tolerance, and mutual respect. Similarly, Hinduism acknowledges the inevitability of pluralism in life.

This is due to the fact that every creature, including humans, carries its own plurality. In sociological studies, humans are referred to as individuals because each person has unique characteristics that are not shared by others. The root of diversity is existential, as humans have limitations in themselves, namely the limitations of the five senses, reason, and language. Religiously, diversity is caused by two factors: *guna* (knowledge and skill) and karma (action and habits). Moving on from this phenomenon, Hinduism appreciates and respects plurality in the context of belief or religion, which is a logical and humane situation. This is because each individual has diverse knowledge and appreciation of the Creator. Therefore, concrete efforts or attitudes are needed to realize tolerance, namely *Widya*, *Maitri*, *Ahimsa*, and *Santi*.

**REFERENCES**


---


